

Association Between Self-Direction and Personal Care Aide Wages

by Denise A. Tyler, Miku Fujita, Susan A. Chapman

University of California, San Francisco, Health Workforce Research Center on Long-Term Care
and RTI International

July 2024

Background

Direct care workers (DCWs), including personal care aides (PCAs), are integral to providing home-based long-term services and supports, aiding individuals with daily activities such as bathing, dressing, meal preparation, and more. These workers operate primarily through state Medicaid-funded programs or are directly employed by service recipients. Despite their critical role in healthcare and patient support, PCAs often receive wages significantly lower than those of other entry-level positions in different sectors. This disparity not only affects their financial well-being but also contributes to persistent worker shortages, especially as the demand for home care services increases due to an aging population and a rise in chronic health conditions.

Study Aims

This study explores the associations between state-level policies, specifically the implementation of self-direction initiatives and the wages of PCAs. By focusing on self-direction—a model that allows home care recipients to hire and manage workers, including setting worker wages in most states—the research seeks to identify whether such policies can effectively mitigate wage disparities between PCAs and other entry-level workers, thereby addressing the dual challenges of economic insufficiency and workforce shortages within this sector.

Study Design

The research design incorporates a comprehensive analysis of PCA wages relative to other entry-level jobs across various states, employing a mixed-method approach that includes both descriptive and comparative analyses. The study utilizes extensive datasets from several sources, such as the U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics (BLS), Medicaid State Waivers List, and the Occupational Information Network (O*NET). By comparing wage data before and after the implementation of self-direction in selected states, the study aims to provide a nuanced understanding of how state policies influence wage dynamics and economic outcomes for PCAs.

Findings

The findings reveal a consistent trend of lower wages for PCAs compared to wages of other entry-level workers across all states, with an average national wage gap of \$3.69 per hour. Despite the potential of self-direction policies to allow for wage-setting home care recipients, the impact on PCA wages was mixed. In states with budget authority, where care recipients receive a budget that can be used to hire

workers or purchase other allowable services, the wage gap was marginally narrower than in states without such authority, suggesting some positive effects of these policies. However, the overall effectiveness of self-direction in improving wages was inconsistent across the studied states, with some showing decreases in the wage gap and others showing increases. This variability highlights the complex interplay between state policies, agency overhead costs, and market forces in determining wages.

Limitations & Future Directions

One significant limitation of the study is the inability to disaggregate PCA wage data for those employed in self-direction models versus traditional agency models due to constraints in the available BLS data. Future research should focus on obtaining individual-level data to evaluate the impacts of self-direction on wages more precisely.

Policy Implications

The study underscores the need for targeted policy interventions that address wage inequities in the PCA workforce. Given the mixed outcomes of self-direction policies on wages, it is clear that relying solely on these policies may not be sufficient to resolve wage disparities. State and federal governments might consider implementing minimum wage guarantees for PCAs or subsidizing wages to make these positions more competitive with other entry-level jobs. Policies that support or enhance the ability of PCAs to unionize and engage in collective bargaining could also play a crucial role in advocating for fair wages and better working conditions. Additionally, exploring the effects of hiring family members as PCAs and their willingness to accept lower wages for more service hours could provide valuable insights into wage dynamics within self-directed care. Further studies could also investigate the potential of unionization and collective bargaining as mechanisms to enhance wage equity and worker rights in this sector.

Conclusion

The research highlights the critical issue of low wages for PCAs and the limited impact of self-direction policies in consistently improving these wages across different states. While self-direction enhances autonomy for HCBS participants, its effectiveness in addressing wage disparities among PCAs is variable and often insufficient. This study calls for a reevaluation of current policies. It suggests that more robust and direct interventions are necessary to ensure fair compensation for PCAs, thereby improving economic outcomes for these workers and potentially alleviating workforce shortages in the home care sector. As the demand for such services continues to grow, ensuring the sustainability of the workforce through adequate wage policies will be essential for maintaining the quality and availability of home-based care.

Full Report

<https://doi.org/10.1177/10775587241273413>

This project was supported by the Health Resources and Services Administration (HRSA) of the US Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) as part of an award totaling \$671,876, with 0% financed by non-governmental sources.